

(d) whether this action has not established that only those scientists are guilty in this case and no one else is involved;

(e) if so, whether it would not hit the image of such senior scientist, who have done a lot for the country; and

(f) the details thereof?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): (a) The former ISRO chief and three other former senior scientists of ISRO (who were already superannuated from service) have been excluded from re-employment, committee roles or any other important role under the Government and have been divested of any current assignment/consultancy by Government.

(b) This decision has been taken based on the reports of the High Powered Review Committee (HPRC) and the High Level Team (HLT).

(c) No, Sir. The High Level Team had sent detailed letters to all the above four officials in July 2011 seeking clarification for their involvement in various lapses and issues, including those pointed out by High Powered Review Committee. While requesting clarification within 10 days, it was also stated that (i) In case there is a requirement, the officer may also be requested to appear before the HLT and (ii) If the officer desires, the HLT would be willing to give opportunity for personal hearing and giving views regarding the agreement. HLT received written replies from the above four officers. Chairman of the HLT provided opportunity for personal hearing as requested by former Chairman of ISRO. Former Chairman of ISRO followed it up with a letter to Chairman, HLT on August 10, 2011.

(d) The above action is based on the names appearing in the High Level Team reports identifying the responsible officers for various acts of commissions.

(e) Does not arise.

(f) Does not arise.

#### **Action taken on high level panel report**

431. SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether is a fact that High Level Panel Report has found serious administrative and procedural lapses in the Antrix-Devas Deal;

(b) if so, the details thereof; and

(c) the action taken/being taken by Government in this regard?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): (a) Yes, Sir.

(b) The High Level Team (High Level Panel) in its report has concluded that there have been serious administrative and procedural lapses and reported

collusive behavior on the part of certain individuals and fixed the responsibilities accordingly.

The HLT have also reported serious lapses of Judgment on the part of a number of officials. In case of some, their actions verged on the point of serious violation of norms and breach of public trust.

(c) Based on the recommendations of the High Level Team report, four former space scientists have been excluded from re-employment, committee roles or any other important role under the Government and have been divested of any current assignment/consultancy with the Government.

Ministry of Corporate Affairs and Department of Revenue are conducting necessary investigation for possible acts of omissions and commissions.

#### **Findings of committee on Antrix-Devas deal**

432. SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact Government has appointed two high-level committees to go into the Antrix-Devas Deal;

(b) whether the two committees have submitted their reports and if so, the salient findings/observations; and

(c) if so, the follow-up action that was initiated by Government on the findings/recommendations of the Committees?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY): (a) Yes, Sir.

(b) Yes, Sir. The High Power Review Committee (HPRC) in its finding, has reported that while agreement with Devas does not indicate any short selling of Spectrum, it does, however, indicate certain financial and strategic gaps, procedural lapses and lack of transparency. The full text of the High Powered Review Committee has been placed on the ISRO website ([www.isro.gov.in](http://www.isro.gov.in)) and Department of Space website ([www.dos.gov.in](http://www.dos.gov.in)).

The High Level Team, in its finding, has pointed out that there have been serious lapses of judgment on the part of number of officials. In case of some, their actions verged on the point of serious violation of norms and breach of public trust. The HLT also has identified officers responsible for various types of omission and commission. The conclusions and recommendations of the High Level team has been put on the ISRO website ([www.isro.gov.in](http://www.isro.gov.in)) and Department of Space website ([www.dos.gov.in](http://www.dos.gov.in)).

(c) Based on the recommendations of the High Powered Review Committee and the recommendations of the High Level Team, the following steps have been taken by Governments:-